

Environment and Sustainability Committee

Meeting Venue: **Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

Meeting date: **Thursday, 5 February 2015**

Meeting time: **08.45 – 13.35**

This meeting can be viewed on [Senedd TV](http://senedd.tv/en/2707) at:
<http://senedd.tv/en/2707>

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



Concise Minutes:

Assembly Members:

Alun Ffred Jones AM (Chair)
Mick Antoniw AM
Gwyn R Price AM (In place of Jeff Cuthbert AM)
Russell George AM
Llyr Gruffydd AM
Julie Morgan AM
William Powell AM
Jenny Rathbone AM
Antoinette Sandbach AM
Joyce Watson AM

Witnesses:

Carl Sargeant AM, The Minister for Natural Resources
Amelia John, Welsh Government
Louise Gibson, Lawyer, Welsh Government
Claire Germain, Welsh Government
Owain Morgan, Welsh Government

Committee Staff:

Alun Davidson (Clerk)
Catherine Hunt (Second Clerk)
Adam Vaughan (Deputy Clerk)
Peter Hill (Deputy Clerk)
Gwyn Griffiths (Legal Adviser)

TRANSCRIPT

View the [meeting transcript](#).

1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

Apologies were received from Jeff Cuthbert. Gwyn R Price attended as substitute.

2 The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill – Stage 2 – consideration of amendments

3.1 In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

Amendment 23 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 23 was agreed		

As amendment 23 was agreed, amendment 120 (Antoinette Sandbach) fell.

Amendment 24 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 24 was agreed		

Amendment 25 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd

Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 25 was agreed		

Amendment 160 (Llyr Gryffudd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 160 was not agreed		

Amendment 161 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 161 was not agreed.		

Amendment 162 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 26C (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 26C was not		

agreed.

Amendment 26A (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 26A was not agreed		

Amendment 26B (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 26B was not agreed		

Amendment 26D (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd		Antoinette Sandbach
Alun Ffred Jones		
Julie Morgan		
William Powell		
Gwyn Price		
Jenny Rathbone		
Joyce Watson		
8	0	2
Amendment 26D was agreed		

Amendment 26E (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	

	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 26E was not agreed		

Amendment 26F (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 26F was not agreed		

Amendment 26 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw	Russell George	
Julie Morgan	Llyr Gruffydd	
Gwyn Price	Alun Ffred Jones	
Jenny Rathbone	William Powell	
Joyce Watson	Antoinette Sandbach	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 26 was not agreed.		

Amendment 27F (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 27F was not agreed		

Amendment 27G (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 27G was not agreed.		

Amendment 27A (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 27A was not agreed		

Amendment 27B (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 27B was not agreed.		

Amendment 27C (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	

William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 27C was not agreed.		

Amendment 27H (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 27H was not agreed		

Amendment 27D (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 27D was not agreed.		

Amendment 27I (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 27I was not agreed		

Amendment 27J (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 27J was not agreed		

Amendment 27E (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 27E was not agreed.		

Amendment 27 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw	Russell George	
Julie Morgan	Llyr Gruffydd	
Gwyn Price	Alun Ffred Jones	
Jenny Rathbone	William Powell	
Joyce Watson	Antoinette Sandbach	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 27 was not agreed.		

Amendment 28 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George

Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 28 was agreed.		

Amendment 29 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 30B (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 30B was not agreed		

Amendment 30A (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 30A was not agreed		

Amendment 30C (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	

5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 30C was not agreed.		

Amendment 30D (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 30D was not agreed.		

Amendment 30E (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 30E was not agreed		

Amendment 30 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw	Russell George	
Julie Morgan	Llyr Gruffydd	
Gwyn Price	Alun Ffred Jones	
Jenny Rathbone	William Powell	
Joyce Watson	Antoinette Sandbach	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 30 was not agreed.		

Amendment 100 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 100 was not agreed		

Amendment 101 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 101 was not agreed.		

Amendment 102 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 102 was not agreed.		

Amendment 103 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	

William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 103 was not agreed.		

Amendment 119 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 119 was not agreed.		

Amendment 163 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 31 (Carl Sargeant) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 104 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 104 was not agreed		

Amendment 32 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 33 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 34 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 35 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 105 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 105 was not agreed.		

Amendment 122 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 122 was not agreed.		

Amendment 123 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 123 was not agreed.		

Amendment 124 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 124 was not agreed.		

Amendment 106 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 106 was not agreed.		

Amendment 125 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 125 was not agreed.		

Amendment 164 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	

Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 164 was not agreed.		

Amendment 165 (Llyr Gruffydd) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 107 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 107 was not agreed		

Amendment 126 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 126 was not agreed.		

Amendment 127 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	

5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 127 was not agreed.		

Amendment 128 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 128 was not agreed.		

Amendment 166 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 166 was not agreed.		

Amendment 167 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	William Powell	
Antoinette Sandbach	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
4	6	0
Amendment 167 was not agreed		

Amendment 129 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 129 was not agreed.		

Amendment 130 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 130 was not agreed.		

Amendment 131 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
Antoinette Sandbach	Jenny Rathbone	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 131 was not agreed.		

Amendment 132 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	

Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 132 was not agreed.		

Amendment 133 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 133 was not agreed.		

Amendment 134 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 134 was not agreed.		

Amendment 135 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 135 was not agreed.

Amendment 108 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
William Powell	Mick Antoniw	
	Russell George	
	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
1	9	0
Amendment 108 was not agreed		

Amendment 168 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 168 was not agreed.		

Amendment 169 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 169 was not		

agreed.

Amendment 73 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		Antoinette Sandbach
Joyce Watson		William Powell
5	0	5
Amendment 73 was agreed		

As amendment 73 was agreed, amendment 170 (Llyr Gruffydd) fell.

Amendment 99 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones		Llyr Gruffydd
Julie Morgan		Antoinette Sandbach
Gwyn Price		William Powell
Jenny Rathbone		
Joyce Watson		
6	0	4
Amendment 99 was agreed		

Amendment 109 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones	Julie Morgan	Antoinette Sandbach
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 109 was not agreed		

Amendment 136 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	William Powell
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	

Antoinette Sandbach	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
4	5	1
Amendment 136 was not agreed.		

Amendment 171 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Alun Ffred Jones		Llyr Gruffydd
Julie Morgan		William Powell
Gwyn Price		Antoinette Sandbach
Jenny Rathbone		
Joyce Watson		
6	0	4
Amendment 171 was agreed		

Amendment 172 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	William Powell
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
2	7	1
Amendment 172 was not agreed		

Amendment 137 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	William Powell
Antoinette Sandbach	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
2	7	1

Amendment 137 was not agreed

Amendment 110 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 110 was not agreed		

Amendment 173 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd		William Powell
Julie Morgan		Antoinette Sandbach
Gwyn Price		
Jenny Rathbone		
Alun Ffred Jones		
Joyce Watson		
7	0	3
Amendment 173 was agreed		

Amendment 174 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 174 was not agreed		

Amendment 175 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 175 was not agreed.		

Amendment 111 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 111 was not agreed.		

Amendment 36 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 36 was agreed		

Amendment 112 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 112 was not agreed.

Amendment 113 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 113 was not agreed.

Amendment 138 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 138 was not agreed.

Amendment 85A (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 85A was not agreed.

Amendment 85 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 85 was agreed		

Amendment 86 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 86 was agreed		

Amendment 87 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 87 was agreed		

Amendment 88 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 88 was agreed		

Amendment 89 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 89 was agreed		

Amendment 90A (Llyr Gruffydd) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 90 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 90 was agreed		

Amendment 140 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	Alun Ffred Jones
Antoinette Sandbach	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Julie Morgan	
	William Powell	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
2	7	1
Amendment 140 was not agreed		

Amendment 91 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones

Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 91 was agreed		

Amendment 176 (Llyr Gruffydd) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 92 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 92 was agreed		

Amendment 93 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 93 was agreed		

Amendment 94 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 94 was agreed		

Amendment 95 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 95 was agreed		

Amendment 96 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 96 was agreed		

Amendment 97 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 97 was agreed		

Amendment 114 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 114 was not agreed.		

Amendment 74 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 74 was agreed		

Amendment 141 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 141 was not agreed.		

Amendment 115 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Antoinette Sandbach	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 115 was not agreed		

Amendment 143 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	

Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 143 was not agreed.		

Amendment 144 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 144 was not agreed.		

Amendment 116 (William Powell) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 177 (Llyr Gruffydd) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 1 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 1 was agreed		

Amendment 178 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 179 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 145 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 145 was not agreed.		

Amendment 180 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 37 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 2 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 2 was agreed		

Amendment 3 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 3 was agreed		

Amendment 4 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell

Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 4 was agreed		

Amendment 38A (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 38A was not agreed.		

Amendment 38B (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 38B was not agreed.		

Amendment 38 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 38 was agreed		

Amendment 5 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 6 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 7 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 8 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 9 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 181 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 181 was not agreed.		

Amendment 182 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 182 was not agreed.		

Amendment 39 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 40 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 10 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 41 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 11 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 12 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 42 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 13 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 14 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 15 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 43 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 44 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 45 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 46 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 47 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 16 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 48 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 49 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 50 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 51 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 52 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 75 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell

Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 75 was agreed		

Amendment 146 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	Alun Ffred Jones
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
Antoinette Sandbach	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
4	5	1
Amendment 146 was not agreed		

Amendment 147 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	Alun Ffred Jones
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
William Powell	Gwyn Price	
Antoinette Sandbach	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
4	5	1
Amendment 147 was not agreed		

Amendment 76 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 76 was agreed		

Amendment 77 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell

Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 77 was agreed		

Amendment 148 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 148 was not agreed.		

Amendment 149 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 149 was not agreed.		

Amendment 78 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 78 was agreed		

Amendment 150 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
------------------	----------------	----------------

Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 150 was not agreed.		

Amendment 151 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 151 was not agreed.		

Amendment 152 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 152 was not agreed.		

Amendment 153 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	

Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 153 was not agreed.		

Amendment 154 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 154 was not agreed.		

Amendment 117 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 117 was not agreed.		

Amendment 155 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 155 was not agreed.		

agreed.

Amendment 17 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 17 was agreed.		

Amendment 156 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 156 was not agreed.		

Amendment 157 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 157 was not agreed.		

Amendment 158 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	Llyr Gruffydd
William Powell	Julie Morgan	Alun Ffred Jones

Antoinette Sandbach	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	5	2
Amendment 158 was not agreed.		

Amendment 79 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 80 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 81 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 82 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 18 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 18 was agreed.		

Amendment 159 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	Llyr Gruffydd
Antoinette Sandbach	Julie Morgan	Alun Ffred Jones
	Gwyn Price	William Powell
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
2	5	3
Amendment 159 was not agreed.		

Amendment 118 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	

Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 118 was not agreed.		

Amendment 53 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 54 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 55 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 56 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 57 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 58 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 59 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 60 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 19 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 20 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 83 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 21 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 183 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 184 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 185 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 186 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 22 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 62A (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 62 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 63 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 64 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 66 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 65 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 67 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 68 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 69 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 98 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 121 (Antoinette Sandbach)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
William Powell	Llyr Gruffydd	
Antoinette Sandbach	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Julie Morgan	
	Gwyn Price	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	Joyce Watson	
3	7	0
Amendment 121 was not agreed.		

Amendment 84 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 70 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 71 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 72 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 61A (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 61A was not agreed.		

Amendment 61B (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Llyr Gruffydd	Julie Morgan	
Alun Ffred Jones	Gwyn Price	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
Antoinette Sandbach	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 61B was not agreed.		

Amendment 61 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Mick Antoniw		Russell George
Julie Morgan		Llyr Gruffydd
Gwyn Price		Alun Ffred Jones
Jenny Rathbone		William Powell
Joyce Watson		Antoinette Sandbach
5	0	5
Amendment 61 was agreed.		